Biofilm synthesis and presence of virulence factors among enterococci isolated from patients and water samples

Matthaios Papadimitriou-Olivgeris, 1 Sevasti Filippidou, 2† Eleanna Drougka, 3 Fotini Fligou, 4 Fevernia Kolonitsiou, 3 Vasiliki Dodou, 5 Markos Marangos, 1 Evangelos D. Anastassiou, 3 Apostolos Vantarakis 2 and Iris Spiliopoulou 3

1Division of Infectious Diseases, School of Medicine, University of Patras, Patras, Greece
2Environmental Microbiology Unit, Department of Public Health, School of Medicine, University of Patras, Patras, Greece
3Department of Microbiology, School of Medicine, University of Patras, Patras, Greece
4Department of Anaesthesiology and Intensive Care Medicine, School of Medicine, University of Patras, Patras, Greece
5Intensive Care Unit, General Hospital ‘Saint Andrew’, Patras, Greece

The goal of this study was to compare biofilm synthesis among enterococci recovered from clinical samples (infection or colonization) of patients as well as environmental samples in order to determine possible virulence factors and clonal relationship. During a two-year period, clinical samples (blood, catheter tips, bronchial secretions, wounds, peritoneal fluid, urine) and rectal swabs collected from hospitalized patients as well as environmental water samples were tested for the presence of Enterococcus faecalis and Enterococcus faecium. Antibiotic susceptibility testing was performed by the disc diffusion method and Etest. Strains were tested for the presence of vanA, vanB, esp, ace and asp genes by PCR. Clones were identified by PFGE (SmaI). From infected patients, 48 strains were identified: 24 Enterococcus faecium (10 vanA-positive, 14 vancomycin-susceptible) and 24 Enterococcus faecalis (one vanA-positive, 23 vancomycin-susceptible). Among 143 colonizing isolates, 134 were Enterococcus faecium (58 vanA-positive, 11 vanB-positive, 65 vancomycin-susceptible) and nine Enterococcus faecalis (three vanA-positive, two vanB-positive, four vancomycin-susceptible). Among 167 environmental water samples, 51 Enterococcus faecalis and 19 Enterococcus faecium isolates, all glycopeptide-susceptible, were recovered. In total, 64 strains produced biofilm, whereas 34 were esp-positive, 64 asp-positive and 54 ace-positive. Biofilm production was associated with the presence of esp (P<0.001) and ace genes (P=0.021), being higher in infecting (P<0.001) and water (P 0.005) isolates as compared with colonizing ones. Clones of environmental water-strains were different than the patients’ clones. The differences found in the incidence of antibiotic resistance, virulence factors and clones suggest that hospital and water enterococci are of different origin.

INTRODUCTION

Enterococci are bacteria that have developed mechanisms to colonize and survive mainly in the gastrointestinal tract of humans. They constitute an important cause of nosocomial infections, the most common species being Enterococcus faecalis and Enterococcus faecium (Abriouel et al., 2008; Comerlato et al., 2013; Papadimitriou-Olivgeris et al., 2014). Their ability to produce biofilm has been implicated in the induction of infections (Upadhyaya et al., 2011). The Enterococcus surface protein (Esp), encoded by the esp gene, acts as an adhesin and is involved in the formation of biofilms (Upadhyaya et al., 2011), although this association has not been confirmed by other investigators (Comerlato et al., 2013). Many proteins have been implicated in enterococcal virulence (Elsner et al., 2000). The most commonly implicated are the

1Present address: Laboratory of Microbiology, University of Neuchatel, Emile-Argand 11, CH2000 Neuchatel, Switzerland.

Abbreviations: CI, confidence interval; ICU, intensive care unit; OR, odds ratio; VRE, vancomycin-resistant enterococci.
aggregation substance (asp gene) enhancing the adherence to matrix proteins and the collagen-binding protein encoded by the ace gene (Dupré et al., 2003; Vankerkhoven et al., 2004).

Nowadays, a great proportion of nosocomial enterococcal infections are caused by vancomycin-resistant enterococci (VRE) strains (Comerlato et al., 2013). The most commonly identified genes conferring resistance to glycopeptides are vanA and vanB genes, whereas the majority of VRE are Enterococcus faecium (90 %) (Papadimitriou-Oliveris et al., 2014).

Enterococci, as well as Escherichia coli, are frequently used as indicators of faecal contamination of fresh or marine water quality worldwide, since their presence is highly correlated with swimming- or drinking-associated gastrointestinal illness (Thevenon et al., 2012). Enterococcus faecium isolates from wastewater, marine or river water are drug-resistant and belong to clonal complex 17 (CC17), which is associated with hospital strains (Sadowy & Luczkiewicz, 2014). In Greece, previous studies showed that environmental Enterococcus faecalis and Enterococcus faecium isolates exhibit low resistance rates (<10 %) for ampicillin, gentamicin and vancomycin (Grammenou et al., 2006). A high proportion of enterococci from water samples often produce biofilm and carry virulence genes, which have been implicated in the induction of clinical infections. (Abriouel et al., 2008; Ahmad et al., 2014; Comerlato et al., 2013) The presence of such isolates in river or coastal waters poses an important public health problem since they can be a relevant source of resistance and virulence spread to humans.

The goal of this study was to investigate biofilm synthesis, clonality and presence of virulence determinants among enterococci recovered from clinical samples (infecting or colonizing isolates) of hospitalized patients and environmental water samples collected from nearby seashores in order to determine potential strains’ clonal and virulence dissemination associated with any of the aforementioned sources.

METHODS

Bacterial strains from hospitalized patients. The study was conducted from January 2010 to December 2011 in the Medical Microbiology Laboratory at the University of Patras. A collection of 24 Enterococcus faecalis and 24 Enterococcus faecium isolates recovered from clinical samples (blood, catheter tips, bronchial secretions, wounds, peritoneal fluid, urine) of infected adult patients as well as nine Enterococcus faecalis and 134 Enterococcus faecium colonizing isolates was investigated. Patients were hospitalized at the University General Hospital of Patras, a tertiary-care hospital with 700 beds and approximately 100 000 annual admissions (including one-day admissions).

Bacterial strains from water samples. One hundred and sixty-seven water samples were collected from environmental water sources of the Achaia Prefecture (south-western Greece). Samples were analysed according to ISO standard methods for the detection and enumeration of Enterococcus spp. (ISO 7899-02 : 2000). In total, 19 Enterococcus faecium and 51 Enterococcus faecalis isolates were further investigated.

Identification and antimicrobial susceptibility testing. Enterococci were identified phenotypically by Gram stain, catalase production and the Vitek 2 Advanced Expert System (bioMérieux). Susceptibility to ampicillin, erythromycin and chloramphenicol was determined by the disc diffusion method, whereas, MICs of vancomycin, teicoplanin, linezolid, daptomycin, tigecycline and gentamicin (high-level) were determined by a gradient method (Etest, bioMérieux). Results were interpreted according to Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI, 2012) guidelines.

Biofilm synthesis and presence of virulence factors. All isolates were tested for biofilm formation, as described by Extremina et al. (2011). Briefly, a 1 : 40 dilution of overnight bacterial cultures in tryptic soy broth (TSB; Becton Dickinson) with 0.5 % glucose was used to inoculate wells in a microtitre polystyrene plate. All biofilm assays were performed in triplicate. After 48 h of incubation at 37 °C, plates were washed three times with dH2O. They were then dried for 1 h at 60 °C in an inverted position, followed by addition of 200 μl 0.1 % safranin into each well. Wells were washed three times with dH2O. Safranin bound to biofilm was solubilized in 200 μl dH2O and absorbance was measured at 490 nm with an automated microplate reader. Reference strains Staphylococcus epidermidis ATCC 35984 (RP62A) and ATCC 12228 were used as positive and negative controls, respectively. Biofilm formation was considered to be moderate or high when absorbance was >0.150 OD490 and weak or absent when OD490 ≤ 0.150 (Extremina et al., 2011).

The presence of vanA and vanB genes (conferring resistance to vancomycin), as well as esp, asp and ace (encoding enterococcal surface, aggregation substance and collagen-binding proteins, respectively), was investigated by PCR (Bell et al., 1998; Mannu et al., 2003; Vankerkhoven et al., 2004).

Genotypes of isolates. Clones were identified by PFGE of chromosomal Smal DNA digests, interpreted according to already established criteria (Tenover et al., 1995). PFGE types of Enterococcus faecalis were identified by capital letters and those of Enterococcus faecium by lower-case letters.

Statistical analysis. SPSS version 19.0 software was used for data analysis. Categorical variables were analysed by using the Fisher exact test or χ2 and continuous variables with the Mann–Whitney U test, as appropriate. Univariate analysis was used to determine those risk factors associated with biofilm production. Backward stepwise multiple logistic regression analysis used all significant variables from the univariate analysis with a P<0.05 in order to determine which ones were independently associated with biofilm synthesis. Odds ratios (ORs) and 95 % confidence intervals (CIs) were calculated to evaluate the strength of any association. All statistical tests were two-tailed and P<0.05 was considered statistically significant.

RESULTS

Infesting and colonizing strains

Forty-eight infecting strains (one strain per patient) were included; 21 recovered from patients hospitalized in medical wards, 13 in surgical wards and 14 in intensive care units (ICUs). Sixteen were isolated from primary bacteraemias, 11 from urinary tract infections, eight from intra-abdominal infections, six from skin and soft-tissue infections, five from catheter-related bloodstream infections and two from
pneumonias. Twenty-four (50%) were Enterococcus faecium (10 vanA-positive and 14 vancomycin-susceptible) and 24 Enterococcus faecalis (one vanA-positive and 23 vancomycin-susceptible). Among the 48 isolates, biofilm synthesis was observed in 26 (54%), while 17 (35%) each (19%) and nine (19%) were positive for the presence of esp, asp and ace genes, respectively. Bloodstream infections (primary or catheter-related), as compared with the other sources of infection, were associated with the presence of esp (52% vs 12%, P=0.0008). No other association among biofilm or virulence genes and specific infection source was observed. Enterococcus faecium isolates were classified into four PFGE types, a (14 strains), b (six), d (three) and e (one), whereas Enterococcus faecalis were classified into three pulsortypes, A (20 strains), D (one) and E (three).

Among the 143 colonizing isolates, 33 were recovered from patients hospitalized in the medical wards, 22 from the surgical wards and 88 from the ICUs. The majority (134, 94%) were Enterococcus faecium (58 vanA-positive, 11 vanB-positive and 65 vancomycin-susceptible) and nine Enterococcus faecalis (three vanA-positive, two vanB-positive and four vancomycin-susceptible). Biofilm synthesis was observed in 18 isolates (13%), whereas eight (6%), four (3%) and six (4%) strains were positive for the presence of esp, asp and ace genes, respectively. Enterococcus faecium strains were classified into nine PFGE types with the majority of strains belonging to type a (89 strains, 66%), followed by types d (12), b (10), e (seven), h (seven), g (five), c (three) and i (one). Enterococcus faecalis isolates were classified into four types, A (five strains), D (one), E (two) and F (two).

### Water sample isolates

Among 70 strains recovered from 167 water samples, 19 were Enterococcus faecium (27%) and 51 Enterococcus faecalis (73%), all vancomycin-susceptible. Twenty isolates (29%) were positive for biofilm formation, whereas nine (13%), 46 (66%) and 39 (56%) carried the esp, asp and ace genes, respectively. Enterococcus faecium isolates were classified into 13 PFGE types, with five strains belonging to type j and three to type k, whereas the remaining 11 isolates represented 11 pulsortypes. Enterococcus faecalis isolates were classified into 19 PFGE types, with 24 strains belonging to type G and six to type H, whereas the remaining 21 represented 17 pulsortypes. PFGE types identified among strains from the water samples were different from those recovered from hospitalized patients. Table 1 depicts the characteristics of the human (colonizing, infecting) and water strains.

### Comparison of Enterococcus faecium and Enterococcus faecalis strains

Enterococcus faecium was the predominant species among the colonizing (94%) isolates, whereas, only 27% of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>Antibiotic or gene</th>
<th>All n=261 (%)</th>
<th>Colonizing n=143 (%)</th>
<th>Infecting n=48 (%)</th>
<th>Water n=70 (%)</th>
<th>P*</th>
<th>P†</th>
<th>P‡</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enterococcus faecium/ Enterococcus faecalis</td>
<td></td>
<td>177/84</td>
<td>134/9</td>
<td>24/24</td>
<td>19/51</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antibiotic-resistant isolates</td>
<td>AM</td>
<td>122 (47)</td>
<td>101 (71)</td>
<td>17 (35)</td>
<td>4 (6)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>223 (85)</td>
<td>127 (89)</td>
<td>37 (77)</td>
<td>59 (84)</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.384</td>
<td>0.345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>47 (12)</td>
<td>17 (12)</td>
<td>28 (40)</td>
<td>2 (11)</td>
<td>0.602</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HL-GM§</td>
<td>106 (18)</td>
<td>76 (53)</td>
<td>25 (52)</td>
<td>5 (7)</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIC (mg l⁻¹) by Etest</td>
<td>VA</td>
<td>112.5</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.132</td>
<td>0.026</td>
<td>0.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TEC</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LN</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DPC</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.563</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TGC</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.187</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of genes by PCR</td>
<td>vanA</td>
<td>72 (28)</td>
<td>61 (43)</td>
<td>11 (23)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vanB</td>
<td>13 (5)</td>
<td>13 (9)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>asp</td>
<td>64 (25)</td>
<td>4 (3)</td>
<td>14 (29)</td>
<td>46 (66)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ace</td>
<td>54 (21)</td>
<td>6 (4)</td>
<td>9 (19)</td>
<td>39 (56)</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>esp</td>
<td>34 (13)</td>
<td>8 (6)</td>
<td>17 (35)</td>
<td>9 (13)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.103</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biofilm synthesis (%)</td>
<td>64 (25)</td>
<td>18 (13)</td>
<td>26 (54)</td>
<td>20 (29)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Comparison between human colonizing and infecting strains.
†Comparison between human colonizing and water strains.
§Comparison between water and human infecting strains.
§HL-GM resistance was assessed by Etest.
water isolates belonged to this species. Moreover, *Enterococcus faecium* showed higher resistance rates to most antibiotics. *Enterococcus faecalis* as compared with *Enterococcus faecium* prevailed in biofilm synthesis (37% vs 19%, \(P=0.002\)) and the presence of *esp* (20% vs 10%, \(P=0.029\), *asp* (61% vs 7%, \(P<0.001\)) and *ace* (62% vs 1%, \(P<0.001\)).

**Comparison among biofilm producers and non-producers**

In total, 64 strains produced biofilm (18 colonizing, 26 infecting and 20 water isolates). Table 2 depicts the factors associated with biofilm synthesis. Multivariate analysis among all strains revealed that biofilm production was associated with the presence of the *esp* gene, susceptibility to vancomycin and infecting strains.

**DISCUSSION**

In the present study, biofilm production among enterococci from human and environmental sources was investigated. Infecting and colonizing strains from hospitalized patients and those recovered from water samples were compared for clonal relationship and virulence determinants.

Vancomycin resistance of nosocomial isolates was more common in *Enterococcus faecium* carrying the vanA gene, as was also shown by previous studies (Abriouel et al., 2008; Dupré et al., 2003; Papadimitriou-Olivgeris et al., 2014). No enterococcal water isolate was VRE. In the study of Schwartz et al. (2003), VRE were recovered from all wastewater biofilms collected near the Hospital of Mainz, Germany, but they were not found in drinking water samples. The rates of resistance to ampicillin, erythromycin and gentamicin of water enterococcal isolates in this study were remarkably higher than those recovered from water samples collected from the same region in 2002 (Grammenou et al., 2006). This finding, combined with the characterization of different PFGE types among hospital and water enterococci, suggests that multi-resistant water isolates may derive from other origins such as animal sources. High resistance rates and vanA-positive enterococci from livestock farms and poultry slaughterhouses in northern and central Greece have been characterized (Tzavaras et al., 2012).

Even though the percentage of biofilm production from infecting isolates (54%) is comparable to that reported in previous studies (38–93%) (Comerlato et al., 2013; Dupré et al., 2003; Gozalan et al., 2015; Ira et al., 2013; Tsikrikonis et al., 2012), biofilm synthesis from colonizing isolates (13%) was low (Johansson & Rasmussen, 2013; Tsikrikonis et al., 2012). Furthermore, Tsikrikonis et al. (2012) found that 70% of colonizing isolates were biofilm producers, whereas, in the study of Johansson & Rasmussen (2013), biofilm synthesis was more common in normal flora isolates as compared with those recovered from infective endocarditis. The percentage of biofilm-producers among water isolates in our study was similar to

**Table 2. Comparison between biofilm producers and non-producers among all enterococcal strains**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Non-biofilm-producing enterococci (n=197)</th>
<th>Biofilm-producing enterococci (n=64)</th>
<th>(P)</th>
<th>(P)</th>
<th>OR (95 % CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Enterococcus faecalis</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category of strain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human colonizing</td>
<td>125 (64 %)</td>
<td>18 (28 %)</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.002*</td>
<td>3.3 (1.6–7.1)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human infecting</td>
<td>22 (11 %)</td>
<td>26 (41 %)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>50 (25 %)</td>
<td>20 (31 %)</td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>12.8 (5.1–31.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>esp-positive</td>
<td>8 (4 %)</td>
<td>26 (41 %)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>asp-positive</td>
<td>43 (22 %)</td>
<td>21 (33 %)</td>
<td>0.094</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ace-positive</td>
<td>34 (17 %)</td>
<td>20 (31 %)</td>
<td>0.021</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancomycin-susceptible†</td>
<td>124 (63 %)</td>
<td>52 (81 %)</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HL gentamicin resistance</td>
<td>85 (42 %)</td>
<td>21 (30 %)</td>
<td>0.187</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linezolid MIC (mg l(^{-1}))</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daptomycin MIC (mg l(^{-1}))</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tigecycline MIC (mg l(^{-1}))</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.716</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Comparison of infecting strains with both colonizing and water strains.
†Defined as the absence of vanA or vanB genes.
The most common virulence factor observed was asp (64 strains, 25 %) followed by ace (54, 21 %), whereas, their presence was statistically higher in Enterococcus faecalis. Even though some studies failed to detect these genes in Enterococcus faecium (Dupré et al., 2003; Mannu et al., 2003), in our study, 13 Enterococcus faecium (5 %) carried asp and two (1 %) the ace determinants. Our results are in agreement with the literature concerning higher incidence of virulence genes (esp, asp, ace) among Enterococcus faecalis (Abriouel et al., 2008; Dupre et al., 2003; Elsner et al., 2000). Abriouel et al. (2008) reported lower incidence of ace gene in enterococci from water samples as compared with clinical isolates, a finding contradicting our results, since 39 (56 %) water isolates were ace-positive, while only 15 (8 %) clinical isolates carried the gene.

Among the 64 biofilm-producing strains, 26 (41 %) carried esp, whereas, eight additional esp-positive isolates were biofilm-negative. A strong association between the presence of the esp gene and biofilm synthesis was found, which is consistent with most studies (Tsikrikonis et al., 2012; Upadhaya et al., 2011), even though other investigators failed to find such an association (Comerlato et al., 2013; Ira et al., 2013). The identification of 38 biofilm-producing esp-negative strains suggests that even though esp is important to biofilm production, there are other factors that may affect biofilm formation. This is reinforced by the fact that the collagen-binding protein, encoded by the ace gene, was found to be statistically associated with biofilm synthesis, a fact that is reported for the first time.

Both Enterococcus faecium and Enterococcus faecalis showed genetic diversity, and the presence of virulence determinants as well as biofilm production was not associated with the main clones identified. The fact that PFGE types from hospitalized patients are distinct from those of water samples strongly indicates no clonal spread among the different sources, as shown also by Abriouel et al. (2008), reinforcing that nosocomial VRE do not contaminate river or coastal waters. In another study from the Gulf of Gdansk, Poland, clones associated with resistant nosocomial strains were discovered in wastewater and marine environments indicating the importance of monitoring wastes for the presence of nosocomial isolates (Sadowy & Łuczkiwickicz, 2014).

In conclusion, biofilm synthesis was more frequent in the infecting isolates as compared with colonizing and water ones, associated with the presence of esp and ace genes. Virulence determinants such as esp, ace and asp aid enterococci to overcome the host barriers and provoke clinical infections. The significant differences found in the incidence of antibiotic resistance, virulence factors and PFGE types suggest a distinctive origin of patients’ and water isolates.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Ethics Committee of the University Hospital of Patras approved this study and waived the need for informed consent (approval HEC
REFERENCES


Enterococcus faecalis for presence of esp gene and biofilm production. 
