
L. G. WAYNE,1* R. C. GOOD,2 M. I. KRICHEVSKY,3 Z. BLACKLOCK,4 H. L. DAVID,3 D. DAWSON,4 W. GROSS,6 J. HAWKINS,5 P. A. JENKINS,7 I. JUHLIN,5 W. KÄPPLER,8 H. H. KLEEBERG,9 V. LEVY-FREBAULT,5 C. McDURMONT,10 E. E. NEL,10 F. PORTAELS,10 S. RÜSCH-GERDES,13 K. H. SCHRÖDER,13 V. A. SILCOX,2 I. SZABO,14 M. TSUKAMURA,15 L. VAN DEN BREEN,12 B. VERGMANN,16 AND M. A. YAKRUS7

Veters Administration Medical Center, Long Beach, California 90822; Centers for Disease Control, Atlanta, Georgia 30333; National Institute of Dental Research, Bethesda, Maryland 20205; State Health Laboratory, Brisbane, Australia; Institut Pasteur, Paris, France; Veterans Administration Medical Center, West Haven, Connecticut 06516; University Hospital of Wales, Cardiff, Wales; Institute of Clinical Bacteriology, Malmö, Sweden; Forschungsinstitut für Lungenkrankheiten und Tuberkulose, Berlin-Buch, German Democratic Republic; Tuberculosis Research Institute, South African Medical Research Council, Pretoria, South Africa; State Department of Public Health, Montgomery, Alabama 36130; Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium; Tuberkulose Forschungsinstitut, Borstel, Federal Republic of Germany; Koranyi National Institute of Tuberculosis and Pulmonology, Budapest, Hungary; Chubu Chest Hospital, Obu, Aichi-Ken, Japan; and Statens Seruminstitut, Copenhagen, Denmark16

The open-ended study of the International Working Group on Mycobacterial Taxonomy is an ongoing project designed to characterize slowly growing strains of mycobacteria that do not belong to well-established or thoroughly characterized species. In this third report we describe numerical clusters that encompass the type strains of Mycobacterium szulgai, Mycobacterium triviale, Mycobacterium shimoidei, Mycobacterium asiaticum, Mycobacterium simiae, and Mycobacterium malmoense. Descriptions and discussion of the taxonomic status of three additional unnamed clusters, as well as a cluster that encompasses the erstwhile type strain of the presently invalid species "Mycobacterium paraffinicum," are also presented.

The first cooperative studies of the International Working Group on Mycobacterial Taxonomy (IWGMT) applied numerical taxonomic (NT) analysis to the circumscription of clusters and description of strains that corresponded to established species of mycobacteria (7, 12, 16, 19, 29, 34). The data were generated under permissive rules; i.e., participants chose the methods which they used without restrictions by the coordinators. Separate studies were later undertaken to evaluate the reproducibility of tests that defined the most powerful differential features; the methods used in these reproducibility studies were described and adhered to precisely (35, 36).

In 1977, a cooperative open-ended study was initiated under permissive rules of test selection, in which new strains of slowly growing mycobacteria were introduced on a continuing basis, and the data were analyzed at intervals. The purpose of this study of an expanding set of strains was to characterize slowly growing mycobacterial strains that represented uncommonly encountered species that had not been represented in the first six studies, as well as to recognize clusters of previously unknown taxa.

In the first published report of the open-ended study (37), some "old data" from unclustered strains and from selected type and marker strains in previously published IWGMB studies (16, 29, 34) were combined with "new data" from the strains that had been distributed for the open-ended study. Because of differences in types and numbers of features in the two series of studies, merging the two data bases led to perturbation of the NT matrices (37). In the second report of the open-ended study (38), one analysis was based solely on new data; this excluded a number of type strains of reference species. Most of these strains have now been recoded and were distributed for the generation of new data in the current study. These data, as well as data for newly acquired strains, are included in this third report.

In this report, we include descriptions of expanded Mycobacterium asiaticum and "Mycobacterium paraffinicum" clusters, which were recognized tentatively in the second report (38), and four clusters that were not recognized in prior reports of this study, as well as expanded descriptions of four previously described clusters that correspond to Mycobacterium szulgai, Mycobacterium shimoidei, Mycobacterium simiae, and Mycobacterium malmoense (37, 38).

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Selection of strains. The criteria for and mechanics of introducing cultures into this study have been described previously (37). For reasons discussed previously (38), this report is based on data derived solely from strains that were distributed, freeze-dried, specifically for this open-ended study.

Editing and analysis of data. In addition to the criteria discussed previously (26, 37, 38), two more criteria for suppression of data were introduced into the current analysis. Antimicrobial agents were often tested over wide ranges of concentrations in participating laboratories. The number of concentrations actually entered into the analysis was restricted to no more than three for any drug; the selection was based in part on concentrations that were used by the greatest number of investigators. In addition, the editing program automatically suppressed any feature that was missing for more than 20% of the test strains in performing the NT analysis. NT analyses were based on simple matching coefficients, with sorting by unweighted average linkage.
(23, 26), and a table of feature frequencies was generated for selected clusters (27). The result ascribed to a given strain in a given test, both for NT analyses and for tabulations of feature frequencies, was the modal score (i.e., the result obtained for that strain by the majority of laboratories that performed that test) (39).

RESULTS

After suppression of redundant and incomplete data according to the criteria specified above, an NT analysis based on the 146 remaining features was conducted for 172 strains. The complete matrix (Fig. 1) was resolved into four subsets for convenience of visualization and interpretation (Fig. 2 to 5). After clusters were defined, mean intra- and intercluster matching scores (Table 1) and mean matching scores for each cluster compared with each of the type strains (Table 2) were calculated. Feature distributions in clusters 4 (Mycobacterium gordonae), 7 (Mycobacterium intracellulare), 8 (Mycobacterium scrofulaceum), and 11 (Mycobacterium avium) were not tabulated because these species had been characterized in previous IWGMT studies that were not open ended (16, 34). The criteria for entering a strain into the present study were meant to exclude well-defined members of these species, and strains that escaped the exclusion criteria were likely to be atypical of the species in some key properties.

The first NT subset (Fig. 2) includes cultures derived from the type strains of Mycobacterium flavescens (strain OES 90117, from strain TMC 1541 [= ATCC 14474T]), M. szulgai (strain OES 90134, from strain TMC 1328 [= NCTC 10831T]), Mycobacterium kansasi (strain OES 90130, from strain TMC 1204 [= ATCC 12478T]), Mycobacterium xenopi (strain OES 90137, from strain TMC 1482 [= NCTC 10042T]), Mycobacterium gastri (strain OES 90136, from strain TMC 1456 [= ATCC 15754T]), the “terrae complex” (i.e., Mycobacterium terrae [strain OES 90120, from strain TMC 1450 [= ATCC 15755T]], Mycobacterium nonchromogenicum (strain OES 90118, from strain TMC 1481 [= ATCC 19550T]), and Mycobacterium triviale (strain OES 90013, from strain TMC 1453 [= ATCC 23292T]), as well as M. shimoidei (strain OES 90013, from strain Tsukamura 4796 [= ATCC 27962T]).

Cluster 1 (Fig. 2) consists of seven strains with a mean internal matching score (MIMS) of 86.0% and a mean matching score of 74.2% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). It includes the type strain of M. szulgai (14), with which it exhibited a mean matching score of 84.9%; the next highest score was 79.6%, with the type strain of M. kansasi (Table 2). The M-catalases from five of these strains (strains OES 90001, OES 90011, OES 90020, OES 90036, and OES 90046) all gave reactions of identity as determined by seroprecipitation against cross-absorbed antibody to M-catalase from the type strain of M. szulgai (32). This cluster has been discussed previously (38).

A previous non-open-ended study of the IWGMT included clusters representing M. nonchromogenicum and M. terrae (16), so only the type strains were used in the present study as markers for these species. Strains of M. triviale were not included in the prior study, so strains considered to belong to this species were included in the present study and were members of cluster 2 (Fig. 2). This cluster exhibited a MIMS of 86.8% and a mean matching score of 74.7% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). It includes the type strain of M. triviale (13), with which it had a mean matching score of 83.6%, but the mean matching scores with the type strains of M. terrae and M. nonchromogenicum were only 78.3 and 74.8%, respectively (Table 2). Strains of M. triviale differ from representatives of the other two species in the terrae complex by their ability to grow in the presence of 5% sodium chloride (Table 3) (13). These cultures exhibited spontaneous agglutination and could not be serotyped. None was submitted as a significant pathogen.

Cluster 3 (Fig. 2) consists of six strains with a MIMS of 86.5% and a mean matching score of 77.7% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). The MIMS is probably distorted by the fact that three of the cultures (strains OES 90013T [T = type strain], OES 90014, and OES 90015) were derived from the same patient. Strain OES 90013T is the type strain of M. shimoidei (24); cluster 3 exhibited a mean matching score of 86.9% with this strain and scores of 79.5% or less with all other type strains examined in this study. All cultures exhibited spontaneous agglutination and could not be serotyped. Several features distinguish members of this cluster from other clusters (Table 3). The type strain was isolated from a patient in Japan and was considered to be the agent of pulmonary disease. Two of the strains in this cluster were isolated in Australia; one was considered to be the cause of disease. One strain of unknown significance was isolated in Mississippi.

The second subset (Fig. 3) contains three clusters and includes cultures derived from the type strains of two species, M. gordonae (strain OES 90133, from strain TMC 1324 [= ATCC 14470T]) and M. asiaticum (strain OES 90126, from strain TMC 803 [= ATCC 25276T]). Cluster 4 (Fig. 3) consists of 10 strains with a MIMS of 85.3% and mean matching scores of 78.2% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). It includes the type strain of M. gordonae, with a mean matching score with this strain of 85.7% (Table 2). M. gordonae was examined in previous studies, so most of these strains escaped the exclusion criteria by exhibiting unusual responses in key characters that were used for screening; e.g., 30% of the members of cluster 4 were nonpigmented, 60% were urease positive, and only 50% yielded more than 45 mm of foam in the semiquantitative catalase test, compared with expected frequencies of <1, 1, and 92%, respectively (39).

Cluster 5 (Fig. 3) consists of 11 strains with an MIMS of 84.8% and mean matching scores of 78.8% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). This cluster includes the type strain of M. asiaticum (41), with a mean matching score with this strain of 83.5% (Table 2). Cluster 5 is well separated from cluster 4, with a mean intercluster matching score of only 77.3%; the mean matching score of cluster 5 compared with the type strain of M. gordonae is only 77.2%. However, this apparent distinction is influenced in part by the atypical nature of the strains in cluster 4 and is accentuated by several moderately variable features of strains in cluster 5, which are not sufficiently consistent to be useful for diagnostic purposes. The most striking feature for distinguishing between members of the two species is the consistent photochromogenic behavior of M. asiaticum (Table 3). The M-catalases from three of these strains (strains OES 90028, OES 90052, and OES 90053) were tested by seroprecipitation against cross-absorbed antibody to M-catalase from the type strain of M. asiaticum, and all gave reactions of identity (32); none gave significant cross-reactions with the M. gordonae reference system. Although most of the strains were
FIG. 1. NT matrix of 172 strains of slowly growing mycobacteria, based on 146 features. Symbols are defined on Fig. 2. Symbols that represent matching scores below 80% were not included to help visualize clusters.
smooth, only one of four laboratories performing seroagglutination studies was able to identify one strain (OES 90122) as of serovar "asiaticum." None of the other strains could be assigned to a serovar. Strain OES 90146 was derived directly from strain ATCC 25276T, and strain OES 90126 was derived from strain TMC 803 (= ATCC 25276T). Thus, both of these strains were derived from the type strain, which was isolated in Hungary from a monkey from India, as was strain OES 90144. One strain was found in the lymph node of a pig. Two of the strains were isolated from human sputum and were considered clinically significant, two more strains were isolated on more than one occasion from patients with chronic bronchitis and were considered possible secondary invaders, and three strains were considered insignificant. One nonsignificant human isolate was from the United States, and the balance of the cultures were from Australia.

Cluster 6 (Fig. 3) consists of 10 cultures with a MIMS of 84.9% and mean matching scores of 78.8 and 78.6% with clusters 5 and 12, respectively; the mean matching scores with all other clusters were less than 78.6% (Table 1). Cluster 6 contained none of the type strains and exhibited its highest mean matching score (78.6%) with strain OES 90135, which was derived from the type strain of M. intracellulare (Table 2). Members of cluster 6 were most consistently distinguished from members of cluster 5 by their susceptibility to 16 μg of cycloserine per ml, their resistance to 32 μg of rifampin per ml, their lack of pigment, and their positive responses to tests for nicotinamidase and pyrazinamidase (Table 3). Most of the members of cluster 6 were distinguished from M. avium and M. intracellulare by their high catalase activity and their ability to hydrolyze Tween 80 (Table 3) (39). Four cultures (strains OES 90016, OES 90117, OES 90018, and OES 90019) were derived from the same patient in Japan (25); they could not be typed by any of the laboratories performing seroagglutination tests. The remaining six cultures were isolated from spueta of different patients over an 18-month period in a laboratory in Japan; only one was considered to be clinically significant. Five of these cultures were agglutinated by antibody to M. szulgai in one laboratory, but none yielded a confirmatory absorption test.

The third subset (Fig. 4) contains five clusters and includes cultures derived from the type strains of M. intracellulare (strain OES 90135, from strain TMC 1406 [= ATCC 13950T]), M. avium (strain OES 90138, from strain TMC 724 [= ATCC 25291T]), M. scrofulaceum (strain OES 90132, from strain TMC 1323 [= ATCC 19981T]), the presently invalid species "M. paraffinicum" (strain OES 90139, from strain ATCC 12670), and M. simiae (strain OES 90128, from strain TMC 1226 [= ATCC 25275T]).
scores of 80.8% with cluster 8, 80.3% with cluster 9, 79.9% with cluster 10, and 79.6% with cluster 11 (Table 1). Cluster 7 includes the type strains of both *M. intracellulare* and *M. avium* (22), with mean matching scores of 87.7 and 85.4%, respectively (Table 2). Five strains in this cluster appeared in the MAIS-I cluster in a prior report (38) and were considered to be variants of *M. intracellulare* or *M. avium*, a conclusion that is supported by the results of the present analysis. Eight of the strains in cluster 7 belonged to agglutinating serovars that are usually restricted to *M. intracellulare* (2, 33); strain OES 90032 agglutinated as *M. avium* serovar 6, and strain OES 90138, which was derived from the type strain of *M. avium*, agglutinated in one laboratory as serovar 2 and in another as serovar 16. After the code was broken, the participants from the West Haven Veterans Administration Medical Center examined type-derived strains OES 90135 and OES 90138 with specific nucleic acid probes (GenProbe, San Diego, Calif.) and confirmed them as *M. intracellulare* and *M. avium*, respectively.

Cluster 8 (Fig. 4) consists of six strains, with a MIMS of 85.0% and mean matching scores of 80.8% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). Cluster 8 includes the type strain of *M. scrofulaceum* (22), with a mean matching score of 86.7%; it exhibits a mean matching score of 82.5% with the marker strain of "*M. paraffinicum*" in cluster 9 (Table 2). For reasons cited above, feature frequencies for cluster 8 are omitted from Table 3.

Cluster 9 (Fig. 4) consists of seven strains, with a MIMS of 84.6%, and mean matching scores of 80.3% with cluster 7, 80.1% with cluster 8, 80.2% with cluster 10, and 80.8% with cluster 13 (Table 1). It includes marker strain OES 90139, with a mean matching score of 85.7% (Table 2); this culture was derived from what had been the type strain of "*M. paraffinicum*" (6) until that species lost standing by omission from the Approved Lists of Bacterial Names (22). Features that may be useful for differentiating strains in cluster 9 from *M. scrofulaceum* include growth at 42°C and urease production, with frequencies of 88 and 91%, respectively, for *M. scrofulaceum* (39) and <1% for members of cluster 9 (Table 3). Most members of cluster 9 may be differentiated from *M. simiae* (cluster 10) by the nature of their pigmentation and by their urease reactions (Table 3). Clusters 9 and 13 are poorly differentiated from one another by key biochemical tests, with Tween hydrolysis providing some resolution (Table 3). Cluster 9 included strains from Australia, Japan, and the United States. Only one strain (strain OES 90097) was considered clinically significant; it was isolated at the autopsy of a child whose sibling also had died of a disseminated mycobacterial infection, suggesting a hereditary immune defect.

Cluster 10 consisted of 19 strains with an MIMS of 84.8% and mean matching scores of 79.9% with cluster 7, 80.0% with cluster 8, and 80.2% with cluster 9 (Table 1). This cluster includes the type strain of *M. simiae* (11), with a mean matching score of 87.0%; the next highest score was 82.1% with the marker strain of cluster 9 (Table 2). The M-catalases from 10 of the strains (strains OES 90006, OES 90007, OES 90008, OES 90010, OES 90012, OES 90021,
OES 90022, OES 90024, OES 90025, and OES 90043) gave reactions of identity by seroprecipitation against cross-absorbed antibody to M-catalase from the type strain of *M. simiae* (32). This cluster was discussed in prior reports (37, 38); updated feature frequencies are included in Table 3.

Cluster 11 consists of seven strains with a MIMS of 87.7% and mean matching scores of 79.8% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). This cluster did not include any marker strains, but exhibited a mean matching score of 83.4% with the type strain of *M. avium*, which appeared in cluster 7 (Table 2). One of the strains exhibited spontaneous agglutination, and another was not tested, but the remaining five agglutinated as serovars that are considered to belong to *M. avium* (2, 33). After the code was broken, the participants from the West Haven Laboratory examined strains OES 90170, OES 90185, OES 90191, and OES 90193 with the nucleic acid probe and confirmed all four as members of *M. avium*.

The three cultures that follow cluster 11 (Fig. 4) (strains OES 90080, OES 90083, and OES 90084) were determined to have been isolated from one patient and are not treated as a cluster of different strains.

The fourth subset (Fig. 5) contains three clusters and includes cultures derived from the type strains of *M. malmoense* (strain OES 90125, from strain TMC 802 [= ATCC 29571T]), and *Mycobacterium marinum* (strain OES 90129, from strain TMC 1218 [= ATCC 927T]). Clusters 12 (16 strains with a MIMS of 83.4%) and 13 (12 strains with a MIMS of 85.4%) are poorly resolvable from one another, with a mean matching score of 81.2% between them (Table 1). Cluster 12 exhibits mean matching scores of 81.1 and 80.6% with the type strains of *M. avium* and *M. malmoense*, respectively; cluster 13 exhibits mean matching scores of 79.5 and 78.0% with the type strains of *M. simiae* and *M. malmoense*, respectively (Table 2). The cultures in clusters 12 and 13 were predominantly from laboratories in the United States, with a few from Europe; many of the United States strains had been submitted with the comment that

FIG. 4. NT subset matrix of 53 strains of slowly growing mycobacteria. See also the legends to Fig. 1 and 2.
they resembled *M. malmoense*. Six of the strains in cluster 12 and five of the strains in cluster 13 were considered to be clinically significant. Information on the significance of the rest of the strains in these two clusters was not available. The data in Table 3 (and from the entire untabulated data set) do not identify any single phenotypic feature or combination of features that permits strains to be assigned unequivocally to one or the other of these two clusters. Tests for Tween hydrolysis, pigmentation, growth at 42°C, and urease, in combination, would be useful for excluding members of cluster 12 or 13 from *M. avium* or *M. simiae* (Table 3) (40). Tests for pigmentation, urease, and catalase would be helpful in distinguishing them from *M. malmoense* (Table 3).

Workers in one laboratory found that strains OES 90045 and OES 90042 in cluster 12 are members of the agglutination serovar characteristic of *M. malmoense*; workers in another laboratory reported that strain OES 90045 exhibits a thin-layer chromatography (TLC) lipid pattern like that of *M. malmoense*, but did not report any result for strain OES 90042. No other laboratory in this study appears to have had a reference system for agglutination serotyping of *M. malmoense*, and the laboratory that did have this system did not submit any results for nine of the strains in cluster 12. The serological and TLC results suggest that some strains in cluster 12 (Fig. 5) may actually belong in cluster 14 and that there may be another taxon buried in cluster 12 that has not been clearly defined by NT. No seroagglutination results for any of the strains in cluster 13 were submitted by the laboratory with the *M. malmoense* reference system, so a similar situation may exist in that cluster.

Cluster 14 (Fig. 5) consists of eight strains with a MIMS of 86.5% and mean matching scores of 79.9% or less with all other clusters (Table 1). The mean matching score of this cluster with the type strain of *M. malmoense* (21) was 87.8%, and the mean matching score was 78.1% or less with all other marker strains in the study. Strains OES 90044, OES 90047, OES 90048, and OES 90049 reacted like *M. malmoense* as determined by seroagglutination and by lipid TLC; strains OES 90050 and OES 90051 gave an *M. malmoense* TLC pattern, but failed to agglutinate with any reference sera; strain OES 90165 agglutinated as *M. malmoense*, but was not tested by TLC; enigmatically, the type strain of *M. malmoense*, strain OES 90125, agglutinated like *M. avium* serovar 28, and TLC was not performed. All strains in cluster 14 were clinically significant.

**DISCUSSION**

The Ad Hoc Committee on Reconciliation of Approaches to Bacterial Systematics of the International Committee on
Systematic Bacteriology recently noted the impact on current bacterial taxonomy and nomenclature of techniques for measuring evolutionary divergence in the structure of semantides (i.e., large information-bearing molecules, such as nucleic acids and proteins) and offered recommendations for semantide-based criteria for defining new species (30). Semantide studies and NT are complementary disciplines; NT alone does not establish evolutionary relationships, but it helps to identify areas where molecular studies are needed to clarify or confirm such relationships (28). This is especially evident in attempts to interpret some of the results obtained in the present study. Two types of semantide analyses, deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA) hybridization and catalase immunological distance measurements, have clarified the status of several named mycobacterial species, providing evidence for confirming some species and reducing some species to synonymy with other species. The two methods show a high level of agreement in their power to distinguish between species that may not be easily resolved on the basis of NT alone. For example, T-catalase serology provided the same redistribution of *M. avium* complex serovars between *M. avium* and *M. intracellulare* as was dictated by DNA homology (2, 33), and the results of both DNA hybridization and catalase serology confirmed that *M. scrofulaceum* is a species distinct from either *M. avium* or *M. intracellulare* (1, 2, 33). The ongoing IWGMT open-ended cooperative study is proving to be useful in mycobacterial systematics by (i) identifying previously unrecognized strain clusters and calling attention to the need for semantide analysis to establish their taxonomic status and (ii) providing information on frequency distributions of features that can be used for strain identification.

The earliest clusters to emerge in the NT matrix (Fig. 1), clusters 1 to 6, are the most discrete ones, showing between 6 and 12.1% ΔM (percentage point difference between the mean intracluster matching score and the highest intercluster scores), with a mean value of 8.6% (calculated from data in Table 1). All of these clusters are comprised of strains that hydrolyze Tween 80. *M. szulgai* (cluster 1) is a valid clinically significant species (22), members of which can readily be identified by conventional phenotypic examination (40). Its species status is supported by DNA hybridization (10) and M-catalase serology results (32).

### TABLE 1. Mean intra- and intercluster matching scores, expressed as percentages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>86.9 ± 3.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>70.7 ± 4.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>68.0 ± 4.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>70.8 ± 3.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>72.2 ± 3.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>74.2 ± 3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>72.9 ± 3.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>70.5 ± 4.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>68.8 ± 3.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>66.9 ± 4.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>65.9 ± 3.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>63.4 ± 3.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>60.6 ± 3.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>57.6 ± 3.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mean ± standard deviation.

### Notes

1. M. *gordonae* is a valid species (22), but cluster 4 is not highly representative because of the criteria for entry of strains into this study. *M. asiaticum* (cluster 5) is a valid nomenspecies (22) that is fairly well separated from its immediately neighboring clusters (Fig. 3), and both DNA hybridization and M-catalase serology results support it as a phylogenetic species (10, 32). *M. asiaticum* has been implicated as the cause of human disease more frequently than *M.
M. hominis, M. paratuberculosis, and M. leprae are synonymous with M. avium, M. intracellulare, and M. scrofulaceum to a single series of numbered serovars (43). Subsequently, Baas and colleagues demonstrated by DNA hybridization that M. avium, M. intracellulare, and M. scrofulaceum are phylogenetically distinct (1–3), but that several serovars formerly ascribed to M. intracellulare had to be reassigned to M. avium. These distinctions are also reflected in the serological divergence of the catalasas (31, 33). Similarly, M. simiae (cluster 10), which met the criteria for the MAIS intermediate group (9), has been established as a distinct species by DNA homology (3, 10) and by catalase serology (31, 32).

In contrast, recent DNA studies have provided evidence that Mycobacterium paratuberculosis and Mycobacterium leprae are synonymous with M. avium (15, 20, 44). The phenotypic diversity and intercluster overlap seen in the organisms represented in the M. avium complex may be a consequence of both subspecific variations in the structure of their chromosomal DNAs, as reflected in the different restriction fragment length polymorphisms (41, 42) and the frequent presence of plasmids in members of this complex (5, 17). Since these factors also appear to be correlated with the association of strains with human disease, including acquired immunodeficiency syndrome and possibly Crohn’s disease, and with Johne’s disease in ruminants (5, 15, 17),
TABLE 3. Feature frequencies of 45 modal properties for 10 clusters of slowly growing mycobacteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>RKC no.</th>
<th>Frequency (%) in cluster:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Glucose</td>
<td>25311</td>
<td>0 100 0 0 0 0 0 58 31 17 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I-Propanol</td>
<td>26524</td>
<td>0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glutamate</td>
<td>29227</td>
<td>0 0 0 0 64 50 0 0 0 0 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acetate</td>
<td>98091</td>
<td>86 50 17 91 100 86 100 100 100 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succinate</td>
<td>98092</td>
<td>0 0 0 0 73 70 0 53 31 17 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyruvate</td>
<td>98093</td>
<td>100 17 0 91 100 71 95 100 92 25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Growth in the presence of:
- Oleate (250 µg/ml)
- Picrate (2,000 µg/ml)
- Hydroxylamine (125 µg/ml)
- Hydroxylamine (500 µg/ml)
- NaCl (5%)
- p-Nitrobenzoate (500 µg/ml)
- Isoniazid (1 µg/ml)
- Isoniazid (10 µg/ml)
- Thiacetazone (10 µg/ml)
- Thiophene-2-carboxyhydrazide (1 µg/ml)
- Ethambutol (1 µg/ml)
- Ethambutol (5 µg/ml)
- Ethambutol (10 µg/ml)
- Capreomycin (10 µg/ml)
- p-Aminosalicylate (1 µg/ml)
- Ethionamide (20 µg/ml)
- Cycloserine (16 µg/ml)
- Toluidine blue (300 µg/ml)
- Rifampin (32 µg/ml)
- Growth at 22°C
- Growth at 25°C
- Growth at 42°C
- Growth at 45°C
- Phototrophic
- Semicolorimetric
- Nitrate reduction moderate
- Acetate produces >45 mm of foam
- Catalase produces >45 mm of foam
- Catalase resists 68°C
- Nitrate reduction moderate
- Tween hydrolysis (10 days)
- Tween opacity (5 weeks)
- Aryl sulfatase (2 weeks)

*KRC, Rogosa-Kirbyevsky-Colwell method for coding data on microbial strains for computers (18).
**The RKC system (18) codes for susceptibility to capreomycin; the computer output data were inverted for this table, in which levels of resistance are shown.

expanded studies on the molecular genetics of this group of organisms appear to be of high priority.

The status of cluster 9, which includes strain OES 90139, which was derived from the type strain of the former species "M. paraffinicum" (6), remains unclear. This species lost staphylococcus when it was omitted from the Approved Lists (22) because it could not be distinguished with confidence from "M. scrofulaceum" (34). Semantide-based comparisons are needed to determine whether "M. paraffinicum" should be revived as a species or whether the members of this poorly circumscribed cluster represent phenotypically atypical members of one or more different species.

Clusters 12 through 14 consist of strains that exhibit extensive overlap with one another and with clusters 7 through 11 (Fig. 1). M. malmoense (cluster 14) appears to represent a species that is distinct from other named species on the basis of catalase serology (32) and limited DNA hybridization studies (10). The relationship of clusters 12 and 13 to one another and to cluster 14 needs exploration by semantide-based techniques, especially since all three clusters include clinically significant strains.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This study was supported by the Medical Research Service of the Veterans Administration.
LITERATURE CITED


